



Mathematical Problems in Engineering  
Article ID 310301

## Review Article

### Bilevel Programming and Applications

Vyacheslav V. Kalashnikov,<sup>1,2,3</sup> Stephan Dempe,<sup>4</sup> Gerardo A. Pérez-Valdés,<sup>5</sup> Nataliya I. Kalashnykova,<sup>6</sup> and José-Fernando Camacho-Vallejo<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Departamento de Ingeniería Industrial y de Sistemas, Tecnológico de Monterrey, Avenida Eugenio Garza Sada 2501 Sur, 64849 Monterrey, NL, Mexico

<sup>2</sup>Department of Social Modeling, Central Economics and Mathematics Institute (CEMI) of the Russian Academy of Sciences (RAS), Nakhimovsky Prospekt 17, Moscow 117418, Russia

<sup>3</sup>Department of Electronics and Computing, Sumy State University, Rimsky-Korsakov Street 2, Sumy 40007, Ukraine

<sup>4</sup>Institut für Numerische Mathematik und Optimierung, Fakultät für Mathematik und Informatik, TU Bergakademie Freiberg, Akademiestraße 6, 09596 Freiberg, Germany







<sup>5</sup>SINTEF, Box 4760, Sluppen, 7465 Trondheim, Norway

<sup>6</sup>Facultad de Ciencias Físico-Matemáticas (FCFM), Universidad Autónoma de Nuevo León (UANL), Avenida Universidad S/N, 66450 San Nicolás de los Garza, NL, Mexico

Received 25 June 2014; Accepted 23 July 2014

Academic Editor: Sergii V. Kavun

Copyright © Vyacheslav V. Kalashnikov et al. This is an open access article distributed under the [Creative Commons Attribution License](#), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

-  Abstract
-  Full-Text PDF
-  Full-Text HTML
-  Full-Text ePUB
-  Linked References
-  How to Cite this Article

## Linked References

1. S. Dempe, *Foundations of Bilevel Programming*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2002. [View at MathSciNet](#)
2. S. Dempe, B. S. Mordukhovich, and A. B. Zemkoho, “Necessary optimality conditions in pessimistic bilevel programming,” *Optimization*, vol. 63, no. 4, pp. 505–533, 2014. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
3. S. Dempe and J. Dutta, “Is bilevel programming a special case of a mathematical program with complementarity constraints?” *Mathematical Programming A*, vol. 131, no. 1-2, pp. 37–48, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
4. S. Dewez, M. Labb, P. Marcotte, and G. Savard, “New formulations and valid inequalities for a bilevel pricing problem,” *Operations Research Letters*, vol. 36, no. 2, pp. 141–149, 2008. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
5. L. Thi, T. Duc, and P. Dinh, “A DC programming approach for a class of bilevel programming problems and its application in portfolio selection,” *Numerical Algebra, Control and Optimization*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 167–185, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
6. L. N. Vicente and P. H. Calamai, “Bilevel and multilevel programming: a bibliography review,” *Journal of Global Optimization*, vol. 5, no. 3, pp. 291–306, 1994. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
7. W. Wiesemann, A. Tsoukalas, P.-M. Kleniati, and B. Rustem, “Pessimistic bi-level optimisation,” Tech. Rep., Imperial College London and Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 2012.
8. B. Bank, J. Guddat, D. Klatt, B. Kummer, and K. Tammer, *Non-Linear Parametric Optimization*, Birkhäuser, Basel, Switzerland, 1983.
9. R. Lucchetti, F. Mignanego, and G. Pieri, “Existence theorems of equilibrium points in Stackelberg games with constraints,” *Optimization*, vol. 18, no. 6, pp. 857–866, 1987. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
10. D. Fanghänel, *Zwei-Ebenen-Optimierung mit Diskreter Unterer Ebene und Stetiger Oberer Ebene*, TU Bergakademie Freiberg, Freiberg, Germany, 2006.

11. H. von Stackelberg, *Marktform und Gleichgewicht*, Julius Springer, Vienna, Austria, 1934.
12. J. Bracken and J. T. McGill, "Mathematical programs with optimization problems in the constraints," *Operations Research*, vol. 21, pp. 37–44, 1973. [View at Zentralblatt MATH](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
13. W. Candler and R. Norton, "Multilevel programming and development policy," Tech. Rep. 258, World Bank Staff, Washington, Wash, USA, 1977.
14. L. N. Vicente, C. A. Floudas, and P. M. Pardalos, "Bilevel programming: introduction, history and overview," in *Encyclopedia of Optimization*, C. A. Floudas and P. M. Pardalos, Eds., Kluwer Academic, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 2001.
15. J. F. Bard, *Practical Bilevel Optimization: Algorithms and Applications*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 1998. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
16. K. Shimizu, Y. Ishizuka, and J. F. Bard, *Nondifferentiable and two-level mathematical programming*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Boston, Mass, USA, 1997. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
17. S. Dempe and V. V. Kalashnikov, Eds., *Optimization with Multivalued Mappings: Theory, Applications and Algorithms*, Springer, Berlin, Germany, 2006. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
18. A. Migdalas, P. M. Pardalos, and P. Värbrand, Eds., *Multilevel Optimization: Algorithms and Applications*, Kluwer Academic, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 1998. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
19. S. Dempe, "Annotated bibliography on bilevel programming and mathematical programs with equilibrium constraints," *Optimization*, vol. 52, no. 3, pp. 333–359, 2003. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
20. W. Candler and R. Townsley, "A linear two-level programming problem," *Computers & Operations Research*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 59–76, 1982. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
21. Z. Luo, J. Pang, and D. Ralph, *Mathematical Programs with Equilibrium Constraints*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK, 1996. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
22. J. Outrata, M. Kočvara, and J. Zowe, *Nonsmooth Approach to Optimization Problems with Equilibrium Constraints*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, The Netherlands, 1998.
23. V. Demiguel, M. P. Friedlander, F. J. Nogales, and S. Scholtes, "A two-sided relaxation scheme for mathematical programs with equilibrium constraints," *SIAM Journal on Optimization*, vol. 16, no. 2, pp. 587–609, 2005. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
24. S. Leyffer, G. López-Calva, and J. Nocedal, "Interior methods for mathematical programs with complementarity constraints," *SIAM Journal on Optimization*, vol. 17, no. 1, pp. 52–77, 2006. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
25. M. Kojima, "Strongly stable stationary solutions in nonlinear programs," in *Analysis and Computation of Fixed Points*, S. M. Robinson, Ed., vol. 43, pp. 93–138, Academic Press, New York, NY, USA, 1980. [View at MathSciNet](#)
26. D. Ralph and S. Dempe, "Directional derivatives of the solution of a parametric nonlinear program," *Mathematical Programming*, vol. 70, no. 2, pp. 159–172, 1995. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
27. S. Scholtes, "Introduction to piecewise differentiable equations," Tech. Rep. 53/1994, Universität Karlsruhe, Institut für Statistik und Mathematische Wirtschaftstheorie, 1994, <http://www.eng.cam.ac.uk/~ss248/publications/index.html>.
28. S. Dempe, "A necessary and a sufficient optimality condition for bilevel programming problems," *Optimization*, vol. 25, no. 4, pp. 341–354, 1992. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
29. B. S. Mordukhovich, *Variational Analysis and Generalized Differentiation, Vol. 1: Basic Theory*, Springer, Berlin, Germany, 2006.
30. B. S. Mordukhovich, *Variational Analysis and Generalized Differentiation*, vol. 2, Springer, Berlin, Germany, 2006. [View at MathSciNet](#)
31. R. T. Rockafellar and R. J. Wets, *Variational Analysis*, Springer, Berlin, Germany, 1998. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
32. J. V. Outrata, "Necessary optimality conditions for Stackelberg problems," *Journal of Optimization Theory and Applications*, vol. 76, no. 2, pp. 305–320, 1993. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
33. J. J. Ye and D. Zhu, "New necessary optimality conditions for bilevel programs by combining the MPEC and value function approaches," *SIAM Journal on Optimization*, vol. 20, no. 4, pp. 1885–1905, 2010. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
34. S. Dempe, J. Dutta, and B. S. Mordukhovich, "New necessary optimality conditions in optimistic bilevel programming," *Optimization*, vol. 56, no. 5-6, pp. 577–604, 2007. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
35. Y. Ishizuka and E. Aiyoshi, "Double penalty method for bilevel optimization problems," *Annals of Operations Research*, vol. 34, no. 1–4, pp.

- 73–88, 1992. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
36. A. G. Mersha and S. Dempe, “Linear bilevel programming with upper level constraints depending on the lower level solution,” *Applied Mathematics and Computation*, vol. 180, no. 1, pp. 247–254, 2006. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
37. F. Nožička, J. Guddat, H. Hollatz, and B. Bank, *Theorie der Linearen Parametrischen Optimierung*, Akademie, Berlin, Germany, 1974.
38. Energy Information Administration, *FERC Order 636: The Restructuring Rule*, 2005, <http://www.eia.gov/forecasts/steo/>.
39. Energy Information Administration, “FERC Policy on System Ownership Since 1992,” [http://www.eia.doe.gov/oil\\_gas/natural\\_gas/analysis\\_publications/ngmajorleg/fercpolicy.html](http://www.eia.doe.gov/oil_gas/natural_gas/analysis_publications/ngmajorleg/fercpolicy.html).
40. IHS Engineering, “EC Proposes New Legislation for European Energy Policy,” 2008, <http://engineers.ihs.com/news/eu-en-energy-policy-9-07.html>.
41. Environmental Protection Agency, “The Impacts of FERC Order 636 on coal mine gas project development,” 2008, <http://www.epa.gov/cmop/docs/pol004.pdf>.
42. K. T. Midthun, *Optimization Models for Liberalized Natural Gas Markets*, Norwegian University of Science and Technology (NTNU), Faculty of Social Science and Technology Management, Department of Industrial Economics and Technology Management, Trondheim, Norway, 2008.
43. S. Dempe, V. V. Kalashnikov, and R. Z. Ríos-Mercado, “Discrete bilevel programming: application to a natural gas cash-out problem,” *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 166, no. 2, pp. 469–488, 2005. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
44. M. J. Doane and D. F. Spulber, “Open access and the evolution of the US spot market for natural gas,” *Journal of Law and Economics*, vol. 34, no. 2, pp. 447–517, 1994.
45. R. Gutiérrez, A. Nafidi, and R. G. Sánchez, “Forecasting total natural-gas consumption in Spain by using the stochastic Gompertz innovation diffusion model,” *Applied Energy*, vol. 80, no. 2, pp. 115–124, 2005. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
46. F. K. Lyness, “Gas demand forecasting,” *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society D*, vol. 33, no. 1, pp. 9–12, 1984.
47. V. V. Kalashnikov and R. Z. Ríos-Mercado, “A natural gas cash-out problem: a bilevel programming framework and a penalty function method,” *Optimization and Engineering*, vol. 7, no. 4, pp. 403–420, 2006. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
48. N. Keyaerts, L. Meeus, and W. D’Haeseleer, “Analysis of balancing-system design and contracting behavior in the natural gas markets,” in *European Doctoral Seminar on Natural Gas Research*, vol. 24, Delft, The Netherlands, 2009.
49. H. G. Huntington, “Federal price regulation and the supply of natural gas in a segmented field market,” *Land Economics*, vol. 54, no. 3, pp. 337–347, 1978. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#)
50. A. Tomasgard, F. Romo, M. Fodstad, and K. T. Midthun, “Optimization models for the natural gas value chain,” in *Geometric Modeling, Numerical Simulation, and Optimization*, Applied Mathematics at SINTEF, Chapter Optimization Models for the Natural Gas Value Chain, Springer, 2007.
51. C. Borraz-Sánchez and R. Z. Ríos-Mercado, “A hybrid meta-heuristic approach for natural gas pipeline network optimization,” in *Hybrid Metaheuristics*, vol. 3636 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, pp. 54–65, Springer, New York, NY, USA, 2005. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#)
52. A. Chebouna, F. Yalaoui, A. Smati, L. Amodeo, K. Younsi, and A. Tairi, “Optimization of natural gas pipeline transportation using ant colony optimization,” *Computers and Operations Research*, vol. 36, no. 6, pp. 1916–1923, 2009. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Zentralblatt MATH](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
53. A. Kabirian and M. R. Hemmati, “A strategic planning model for natural gas transmission networks,” *Energy Policy*, vol. 35, no. 11, pp. 5656–5670, 2007. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
54. S. A. Gabriel, J. Zhuang, and S. Kiet, “A large-scale linear complementarity model of the North American natural gas market,” *Energy Economics*, vol. 27, no. 4, pp. 639–665, 2005. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
55. R. Egging, S. A. Gabriel, F. Holz, and J. Zhuang, “A complementarity model for the European natural gas market,” *Energy Policy*, vol. 36, no. 7, pp. 2385–2414, 2008. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
56. D. Hawdon, “Efficiency, performance and regulation of the international gas industry: a bootstrap DEA approach,” *Energy Policy*, vol. 31, no. 11, pp. 1167–1178, 2003. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
57. K. G. Arano and B. F. Blair, “An ex-post welfare analysis of natural gas regulation in the industrial sector,” *Energy Economics*, vol. 30, no. 3, pp. 789–806, 2008. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)

58. B. Esnault, "The need for regulation of gas storage: the case of France," *Energy Policy*, vol. 31, no. 2, pp. 167–174, 2003. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
59. V. V. Kalashnikov and R. Z. Ríos-Mercado, "A penalty-function approach to a mixed-integer bilevel programming problem," in *Proceedings of the 3rd International Meeting on Computer Science*, C. R. Zozaya, Ed., vol. 2, pp. 1045–1054, Aguascalientes, Mexico, September 2001.
60. S. Dempe, V. V. Kalashnikov, and G. A. Pérez-Valdés, "Mixed-integer bilevel programming: application to an extended gas cash-out problem," in *Proceedings of the International Business and Economics Research Conference (IBERC & TLC '06)*, p. 14, Las Vegas, Nev, USA, 2006.
61. V. V. Kalashnikov, N. I. Kalashnykova, and G. A. Pérez, "Natural gas cash-out problem with price predictions," in *Proceedings of the International Applied Business Research Conference (ABRC '07)*, R. D. Clute, Ed., p. 13, Mazatlán, Mexico, 2007.
62. V. V. Kalashnikov, G. A. Pérez-Valdés, A. Tomasgard, and N. I. Kalashnykova, "Natural gas cash-out problem: bilevel stochastic optimization approach," *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 206, no. 1, pp. 18–33, 2010. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
63. P. Kall and S. W. Wallace, *Stochastic Programming*, John Wiley & Sons, Chichester, UK, 1994. [View at MathSciNet](#)
64. S. Dempe, V. V. Kalashnikov, G. A. Pérez-Valdés, and N. Kalashnykova, "Natural gas bilevel cash-out problem: convergence of a penalty function method," *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 215, no. 3, pp. 532–538, 2011. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
65. V. V. Kalashnikov, G. A. Pérez, and N. I. Kalashnykova, "A linearization approach to solve the natural gas cash-out bilevel problem," *Annals of Operations Research*, vol. 181, no. 1, pp. 423–442, 2010. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Zentralblatt MATH](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
66. V. V. Kalashnikov, T. I. Matis, and G. A. Pérez-Valdés, "Time series analysis applied to construct US natural gas price functions for groups of states," *Energy Economics*, vol. 32, no. 4, pp. 887–900, 2010. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
67. V. V. Kalashnikov, G. A. Pérez-Valdés, T. I. Matis, and N. I. Kalashnykova, "US natural gas market classification using pooled regression," *Mathematical Problems in Engineering*, vol. 2014, Article ID 695084, 9 pages, 2014. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#)
68. V. V. Kalashnikov, S. Dempe, G. A. Pérez-Valdés, and N. I. Kalashnykova, "Reduction of dimension of the upper level problem in a bilevel programming model. Part 1," in *Advances in Intelligent Decision Technologies*, J. Watada, J. Phillips-Wren, G. Jain, and R. J. Howlett, Eds., vol. 10 of *Smart Innovation, Systems and Technologies*, pp. 255–264, Springer, Heidelberg, Germany, 2011.
69. V. V. Kalashnikov, S. Dempe, G. A. Pérez-Valdés, and N. I. Kalashnykova, "Reduction of dimension of the upper level problem in a bilevel programming model. Part 2," in *Advances in Intelligent Decision Technologies*, J. Watada, G. Phillips-Wren, L. C. Jain, and R. J. Howlett, Eds., vol. 10 of *Smart Innovation, Systems and Technologies*, pp. 265–272, Springer, Heidelberg, Germany, 2011.
70. D. Kinderlehrer and G. Stampacchia, *An Introduction to Variational Inequalities and Their Applications*, Academic Press, New York, NY, USA, 1980. [View at MathSciNet](#)
71. O. L. Mangasarian, "Uniqueness of solution in linear programming," *Linear Algebra and Its Applications*, vol. 25, pp. 151–162, 1979. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
72. J. B. Rosen, "Existence and uniqueness of equilibrium points for concave N-person games," *Econometrica*, vol. 33, no. 3, pp. 520–534, 1965. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
73. R. Nishimura, S. Hayashi, and M. Fukushima, "Robust Nash equilibria in N-person non-cooperative games: uniqueness and reformulation," *Pacific Journal of Optimization*, vol. 5, no. 2, pp. 237–259, 2009. [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
74. G. K. Saharidis and M. G. Ierapetritou, "Resolution method for mixed integer bi-level linear problems based on decomposition technique," *Journal of Global Optimization*, vol. 44, no. 1, pp. 29–51, 2009. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
75. L. Lei, C. Guang-Nian, and L. Chen-Xin, "Research on problems bilevel programming for personnel allocation in enterprise," in *Proceedings of the 17th International Conference on Management Science & Engineering (ICMSE '10)*, pp. 293–298, Melbourne, Australia, November 2010. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
76. T. Roughgarden, "Stackelberg scheduling strategies," *SIAM Journal on Computing*, vol. 33, no. 2, pp. 332–350, 2004. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
77. J. Xu, Y. Tu, and Z. Zeng, "Bilevel optimization of regional water resources allocation problem under fuzzy random environment," *Journal of Water Resources Planning and Management*, vol. 139, no. 3, pp. 246–264, 2013. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
78. S. Fang, P. Guo, M. Li, and L. Zhang, "Bilevel multiobjective programming applied to water resources allocation," *Mathematical Problems in Engineering*, vol. 2013, Article ID 837919, 9 pages, 2013. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
79. G. Hongli, L. Juntao, and G. Hong, "A survey of bilevel programming model and algorithm," in *Proceedings of the 4th International*

- Symposium on Computational Intelligence and Design (ISCID '11)*, pp. 199–203, Hangzhou, China, October 2011. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
80. H. W. Ho and S. C. Wong, “Housing allocation problem in a continuum transportation system,” *Transportmetrica*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 21–39, 2007. [View at Scopus](#)
81. J. Yin, S. C. Wong, N. N. Sze, and H. W. Ho, “A continuum model for housing allocation and transportation emission problems in a polycentric city,” *International Journal of Sustainable Transportation*, vol. 7, no. 4, pp. 275–298, 2013. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
82. R. Liang, J. Gao, and K. Iwamura, “Fuzzy random dependent-chance bilevel programming with applications,” in *Advances in Neural Networks-ISBN 2007*, vol. 4492 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, pp. 257–266, Springer, Berlin, Germany, 2007. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#)
83. S. Y. Wang and F. A. Lootsma, “A hierarchical optimization model of resource allocation,” *Optimization*, vol. 28, no. 3-4, pp. 351–365, 1994. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
84. A. P. Burgard, P. Pharkya, and C. D. Maranas, “OptKnock: a bilevel programming framework for identifying gene knockout strategies for microbial strain optimization,” *Biotechnology and Bioengineering*, vol. 84, no. 6, pp. 647–657, 2003. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
85. H. I. Calvete, C. Galé, and M. Oliveros, “Bilevel model for production-distribution planning solved by using ant colony optimization,” *Computers and Operations Research*, vol. 38, no. 1, pp. 320–327, 2011. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
86. F. Legillon, A. Liefoghe, and E. G. Talbi, “A coevolutionary meta-heuristic for bi-level optimization,” *Rapport de Recherche INRIA*, vol. 7741, pp. 1–22, 2011.
87. J. F. Camacho-Vallejo, Á. E. Cordero-Franco, and R. G. González-Ramírez, “Solving the bilevel facility location problem under preferences by a Stackelberg-evolutionary algorithm,” *Mathematical Problems in Engineering*, vol. 2014, Article ID 430243, 14 pages, 2014. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
88. B. Huang and N. Liu, “Bilevel programming approach to optimizing a logistic distribution network with balancing requirements,” *Transportation Research Record*, no. 1894, pp. 188–197, 2004. [View at Scopus](#)
89. C. M. Feng and C. C. Wen, “A bi-level programming model for allocating private and emergency vehicle flows in seismic disaster areas,” in *Proceedings of the Eastern Asia Society for Transportation Studies*, vol. 5, pp. 1408–1423, 2005.
90. J. Wang, J. Zhu, J. Huang, and M. Zhang, “Multi-level emergency resources location and allocation,” in *Proceedings of the IEEE International Conference on Emergency Management and Management Sciences (ICEMMS '10)*, pp. 202–205, August 2010. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
91. H. Sun, Z. Gao, and J. Wu, “A bi-level programming model and solution algorithm for the location of logistics distribution centers,” *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, vol. 32, no. 4, pp. 610–616, 2008. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
92. J. Xu and P. Wei, “A bi-level model for location-allocation problem of construction and demolition waste management under fuzzy random environment,” *International Journal of Civil Engineering*, vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 1–12, 2012. [View at Scopus](#)
93. P. Hansen, Y. A. Kochetov, and N. Mladenovic, “Lower bounds for the uncapacitated facility location problem with user preferences,” *G-2004-24*, GERAD-HEC, Montreal, Canada, 2004.
94. I. L. Vasil'ev, K. B. Klimentova, and Y. A. Kochetov, “New lower bounds for the facility location problem with client preferences,” *Computational Mathematics and Mathematical Physics*, vol. 49, no. 6, pp. 1055–1066, 2009. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
95. I. L. Vasil'ev and K. B. Klimentova, “The branch and cut method for the facility location problem with clients preferences,” *Journal of Applied and Industrial Mathematics*, vol. 4, no. 3, pp. 441–454, 2010.
96. M. Marić, Z. Stanimirović, and N. Milenković, “Metaheuristic methods for solving the bilevel uncapacitated facility location problem with clients' preferences,” in *EURO Mini Conference*, vol. 39 of *Electronic Notes in Discrete Mathematics*, pp. 43–50, Elsevier, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
97. J. Bhadury, J. H. Jaramillo, and R. Batta, “On the use of genetic algorithms to solve location problems,” *Computers & Operations Research*, vol. 29, no. 6, pp. 761–779, 2002. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
98. T. Uno, H. Katagiri, and H. Kato, “An application of particle swarm optimization to bilevel facility location problems with quality of facilities,” *Asia Pacific Management Review*, vol. 12, no. 4, pp. 183–189, 2007.
99. V. Marianov, M. Ríos, and M. Icaza, “Facility location for market capture when users rank facilities by shorter travel and waiting times,” *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 191, no. 1, pp. 32–44, 2008. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
100. C. M. C. Rodríguez, D. R. S. Peñate, and J. A. M. Pérez, “Competencia espacial por cuotas de mercado: el problema del líder-seguidor

- mediante programación lineal,” *Recta*, vol. 12, no. 1, pp. 69–84, 2011 (Spanish). [View at Scopus](#)
101. H. Küçükaydin, N. Aras, and I. K. Altinel, “Competitive facility location problem with attractiveness adjustment of the follower: a bilevel programming model and its solution,” *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 208, no. 3, pp. 206–220, 2011. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
102. V. L. Beresnev, “Local search algorithms for the problem of competitive location of enterprises,” *Automation and Remote Control*, vol. 73, no. 3, pp. 425–439, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
103. D. Kress and E. Pesch, “Sequential competitive location on networks,” *European Journal of Operational Research*, vol. 217, no. 3, pp. 483–499, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
104. D. Kress and E. Pesch, “ $(r|p)$ -centroid problems on the networks with vertex and edge demand,” *Computers & Operations Research*, vol. 39, no. 12, pp. 2954–2967, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
105. H. Küçükaydin, N. Aras, and K. Altinel, “A leader-follower game in competitive facility location,” *Computers & Operations Research*, vol. 39, no. 2, pp. 437–448, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#)
106. M. G. Ashtiani, A. Makui, and R. Ramezani, “A robust model for a leader-follower competitive facility location problem in a discrete space,” *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, vol. 37, no. 1-2, pp. 62–71, 2013. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at MathSciNet](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
107. J. R. Kim, J. U. Lee, and J. Jo, “Hierarchical spanning tree network design with Nash genetic algorithm,” *Computers and Industrial Engineering*, vol. 56, no. 3, pp. 1040–1052, 2009. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
108. D. H. Lee, L. Song, and H. Wang, “Bilevel programming model and solutions of berth allocation and quay crane scheduling,” in *Proceedings of the 85th Annual Meeting of Transportation Research Board*, Washington, DC, USA, 2006.
109. P. G. Comba, “Exponentiation cryptosystems on the IBM PC,” *IBM Systems Journal*, vol. 29, no. 4, pp. 526–538, 1990.
110. M. Brown, D. Hankerson, J. Lopez, and A. Menezes, “Software implementation of the NIST elliptic curves over prime fields,” *Research Report CORR 2000-55*, Department of Combinatorics and Optimization, University of Waterloo, Waterloo, Canada, 2000.
111. S.-M. Hong, S.-Y. Oh, and H. Yoon, “New modular multiplication algorithms for fast modular exponentiation,” in *Advances in Cryptology—EUROCRYPT ’96*, vol. 1070 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, pp. 166–177, 1996.
112. A. Weimerskirch and C. Paar, “Generalizations of the Karatsuba algorithm for efficient implementations,” *Cryptology ePrint Archive: Report 2006/224*, 2006, <http://eprint.iacr.org/2006/224>.
113. J. Großschadl, R. M. Avanzi, E. Sava, and S. Tillich, “Energy-efficient software implementation of long integer modular arithmetic,” in *Cryptographic Hardware and Embedded Systems—CHES 2005*, vol. 3659 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, pp. 75–90, Springer, Berlin, Germany, 2005. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#)
114. R. Moreno, J. M. Miret, and F. Sebe, “A hyperelliptic cryptosystem based on the P1363 IEEE standard,” in *Proceedings of the International Meeting on Coding Theory And Cryptography (IMCTC ’99)*, Medina del Campo, Spain, 1999.
115. N. P. Smart, “On the performance of hyperelliptic cryptosystems,” in *Advances in Cryptology—Eurocrypt’99*, vol. 1592 of *Lecture Notes in Computer Science*, pp. 165–175, Springer, Berlin, Germany, 1999.
116. J. M. Arroyo and F. D. Galiana, “On the solution of the bilevel programming formulation of the terrorist threat problem,” *IEEE Transactions on Power Systems*, vol. 20, no. 2, pp. 789–797, 2005. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
117. C.-C. Liu, J. Jung, G. T. Heydt, V. Vittal, and A. G. Phadke, “The strategic power infrastructure defense (SPID) system. A conceptual design,” *IEEE Control Systems Magazine*, vol. 20, no. 4, pp. 40–52, 2000. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)
118. A. Roy, D. S. Kim, and K. S. Trivedi, “Cyber security analysis using attack countermeasure trees,” in *Proceedings of the 6th Annual Workshop on Cyber Security and Information Intelligence Research*, 2010. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#)
119. Y.-L. Yuan, Z.-I. Li, and K.-I. Ren, “Quantitative analysis of load redistribution attacks in power systems,” *IEEE Transactions on Parallel and Distributed Systems*, vol. 23, no. 9, pp. 1731–1738, 2012. [View at Publisher](#) · [View at Google Scholar](#) · [View at Scopus](#)